

Pastoral **C**are
a n d **P**ersonal-**S**ocial
Education

Entitlement and Provision

Edited by Ron Best, Peter Lang,
Caroline Lodge and Chris Watkins



CASSELL STUDIES IN PASTORAL CARE AND PERSONAL
AND SOCIAL EDUCATION

PASTORAL CARE AND PERSONAL-SOCIAL EDUCATION

Entitlement and Provision

Edited by
Ron Best, Peter Lang,
Caroline Lodge
and Chris Watkins

in Association with the
National Association for
Pastoral Care in Education

Continuum



Continuum
Wellington House
125 Strand
London WC2R 0BB

370 Lexington Avenue
New York
NY 10017-6550

© Ron Best, Peter Lang, Caroline Lodge and Chris Watkins, 1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical including photocopying, recording or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher,

First published 1995
Reprinted 1999, 2000

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 0-304-32781-6 (hardback)
0-8264-5093-8 (paperback)

Typeset by Create Typesetting
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
Biddles Ltd, www.biddles.co.uk

Contents

Series Editors' Foreword	vii
Notes on Contributors	ix
Introduction	xii
Part 1 Definitions and Concepts	1
1 Concepts in Pastoral care and PSE <i>Ron Best</i>	3
Part 2 The School and the Teachers	19
2 School management for pastoral care and PSE <i>Caroline Lodge</i>	21
3 Training and support for pastoral care <i>Fergus O'Sullivan</i>	37
4 Personal and social education: pupil behaviour <i>John McGuinness</i>	51
Part 3 Working with Individuals	59
5 Counselling in schools: its place and purpose <i>Colleen McLaughlin</i>	61
6 Guidance and tutoring <i>Phil Griffiths</i>	75
7 Using groups to develop pupils' learning skills <i>Brenda Hopper</i>	88
Part 4 The Curriculum	103
8 The whole curriculum <i>Michael Marland</i>	105
9 Personal-social education and the whole curriculum <i>Chris Watkins</i>	118
10 Assessment and pastoral care: sense, sensitivity and standards <i>Stephen Munby</i>	141

vi CONTENTS

11	Personal-social education for children with special educational needs <i>Phil Bayliss and John Thacker</i>	155
	Part 5 Trauma – Responding to the Unpredicted	169
12	Child protection <i>Steve Adams</i>	171
13	Separation, divorce and the school <i>Martin Desforges</i>	190
14	Schools and pupils: developing their responses to bereavement <i>Patsy Wagner</i>	204
	Part 6 Making the Links	223
15	The school in its community <i>Bernard Clarke</i>	225
16	Home-school links <i>Sally Tomlinson</i>	234
	Part 7 Developments	247
17	Evaluating PSE and pastoral care: how shall we know success? <i>Mary James</i>	249
18	International perspectives on pastoral care (affective education) <i>Peter Lang</i>	266
	Conclusion	285
19	Pastoral care and PSE: principles and possibilities <i>Ron Best, Peter Lang, Caroline Lodge and Chris Watkins</i>	287
	Appendices	301
1	The National Association for Pastoral Care in Education	303
2	The value of pastoral care and PSE: a compilation of research <i>Chris Watkins</i>	304
	Name Index	315
	Subject Index	318

APPENDIX 2

The value of pastoral care and PSE: a compilation of research

Chris Watkins

This appendix aims to bring together evidence and arguments to show the impact and value of pastoral care and personal-social education in schools.

When resources for education are scarce, the aspects of school which are not obviously direct teaching can sometimes come under threat. This is a wrong-headed approach if we are to maintain a central focus on learning and achievement, and are to develop the features of the effective school: 'Effective schools are *demanding* places, where teachers expect and ensure high standards of work and behaviour; at the same time they are *responsive* to pupils, for the teachers are approachable and, since they value pupils, seek to *involve* them in the life and work of the school' (Hargreaves, 1990).

Pastoral care and PSE are at their most effective when they are demanding, responsive and involving. 'We recommend that headteachers and teachers should ensure that pastoral care in schools is characterised by a healthy balance between challenge and support for pupils' (Department of Education and Science, 1989).

In talking about the value and impact of pastoral care and PSE, the question of how to identify them and their effects arises. Both have a general and a specific aspect to them, which might include:

Pastoral care

Personal-social education

specific aspects

tutor groups
individual pupils
guidance
links to parents
other
professionals

general aspects

school climate
care of staff
whole curriculum
all contexts
teaching and
learning

general aspects

personal-social in
all classrooms
whole curriculum
ethos
school
environment

specific aspects

specialist PSE:
careers, health,
tutorials
other guidance

The effects of the specific are influenced by the general: the effects of the general are long-term, linked to other factors, difficult to measure. It is certainly not possible to create simple outcome measures of personal and social development (Assessment of Performance Unit, 1981).

This appendix brings together evidence under headings which identify the value for major stakeholders. In the final analysis it is not advisable to force a strong separation between these: they are interconnected, and what benefits one has positive spin-off for others.

In this book, extra arguments, commentary and analysis have deliberately been withheld. The overall message is that there is available evidence to construct professional arguments for provision in this area. The evidence speaks for itself.

Pastoral care and PSE bring attention to achievement and social development. The two are linked, and promoting both is important. 'In years gone by, educationalists have debated whether *either* a task-oriented, nose-to-the-grindstone approach *or* an emotionally supportive approach designed to make children want to be at school and enjoy their learning was better. The choice is artificial and misleading. *Both* aspects are necessary for optimal learning' (Rutter, 1991).

Approachability of and access to teachers or tutors is important for achievement. 'Pupil outcomes tended to be better in schools where ordinary teachers were available to see children about problems at any time (not just at fixed periods) and where pupils reported that, if they needed to, they would talk to a member of staff about a personal problem' (Rutter, 1983).

Learning is a personal-social process and is enhanced by personal-social attention. 'The successful learner is knowledgeable, self-determined, strategic, and empathetic' (Jones and Fennimore, 1990).

A focus on the personal-social aspects of learning, and on co-operative approaches to learning, enhances achievement. 'The theoretical support for co-operative endeavours appears to be borne out by the research evidence' (Bennett and Dunne, 1992). 'In our studies we have found considerable evidence that co-operative learning experiences promote higher achievement than do competitive and individualistic learning experiences' (Slavin, 1990).

Studies of approaches to learning demonstrate that study skills which focus on surface matters such as reading, note-taking and time management are largely ineffective, whereas a focus on purpose, strategy and review is more effective. Learners need occasions to reflect on their strategies to learning (Gibbs, 1992; Ramsden, 1988; Selmes, 1987).

Tutoring across ages of pupils has been shown to be more effective and more cost-effective than reducing class size, increasing instructional time, or computer-assisted instruction (Fitz-Gibbon, 1988).

Programmes which help students to analyse real life situations, set goals and take responsibility for their actions result in increased motivation for learning and in improved academic achievement (deCharms, 1972).

Adolescents experience and express personal-social difficulties which limit their performance, and which form one strand of personal-social education.

From this date, it is quite clear that these young people had considerable difficulties in relating to parents and teachers, in asserting themselves to achieve their goals, and in relating to the opposite sex and to people in authority. They had inaccurate

and damaging ideas on the degree to which they could change themselves or their life situation.

(Hopson and Hough, 1976, considering 235 15- to 16-year-olds)

Adolescent concerns may be adequately described along the dimensions of: Myself, At Home, Assertiveness, Opposite Sex, Communication, Powerlessness, School Work, Coping with Change, Choosing a Job, Job Finding, Job Information Seeking, Starting Work, Money Matters (Millar *et al.*, 1993, considering 378 15- to 16-year-olds; Gallagher *et al.*, 1992, considering 446 15- to 18-year-olds).

'Planning, decision-making and taking responsibility may be central to young people's perspectives of life skills' (Poole and Evans, 1988, a study of fifteen facets of life skills with 1,084 15- to 18-year-olds).

Pupils' personal problems can be increased or decreased by school atmosphere.

First it appeared that pupils in over-controlling schools expressed more problems with authority. In such cases it seemed that the school engendered problems by being over-controlling in its climate. Secondly, where low levels of concern for pupils were perceived, it seemed that pupils experienced more problems in peer group areas. In other words, schools with concerned atmospheres had pupils who were more likely to get on well with each other.

(Porteous and Kelleher, 1987, considering 349 pupils in fifteen secondary schools)

Helping students tutor each other has positive benefits for all.

These programs have positive effects on the academic performance and attitudes of those who receive tutoring. Tutored students out-performed control students on examinations and they also developed positive attitudes toward the subject matter covered in the tutorial programs. The analysis also showed that tutoring programs have positive effects on the children who serve as tutors.

(Cohen *et al.*, 1982, an analysis of sixty-five evaluations of peer tutoring)

Students who are deemed at risk can continue to succeed in supportive schools: 'The key finding from our research is that effective schools provide at-risk students with a community of support ... in which school membership and educational engagement are central' (Wehlage *et al.*, 1989).

Nearly a quarter of the teenagers who could talk to a member of staff about personal relationships said they would turn to their form tutor. The importance of pastoral care was underlined by the fact that nearly a fifth of the teenagers who felt they could ask a member of staff about sex or contraception cited a form tutor, head of year, head or deputy head of school, with the older teenagers more likely to cite the latter, mainly, it appeared, because they had more contact with them or because they taught the personal and social education programme.

(Allen, 1987).

The young people we talked to felt that their learning about preparation for parenthood in schools was patchy and inadequate ... They identified that things like communication, relationship and personal development skills are sometimes included in tutorial time at school – but only if the teacher is interested. (Braun and Schonveld, 1992, considering 83 young people)

THE VALUE FOR PARENTS

Parents gave substantial support to these two statements:

Children's personal and social development at school is at least as important as their academic development.

The most important thing about a school is whether the children are happy and enjoy their lessons.

(Elliott, 1981, on fourth-year parents choosing from over forty statements: cited in Johnson, 1990)

Also:

Parental choice of school is most strongly influenced by pragmatic and pastoral considerations, 'factors which direct little attention, if any, to the actual structure of what the child will receive by way of educational content or method' ... 'the majority of parents who are exercising choice on behalf of their child are doing so from a humanistic rather than technological perspective, being less concerned with measurable criteria than with the creation of an atmosphere supportive to the child's well-being'.

(Johnson, 1990, quoting Petch, 1986, a survey of one thousand parents)

Of parent-teacher associations, 64 per cent consider that staff do not have adequate time to develop pastoral contact with pupils, and that this is one of the most important problems facing schools; 55 per cent consider that staff do not have adequate time to talk to parents (National Confederation of Parent-Teachers Associations, 1991, a survey of 2,051 parent-teachers associations).

Of parents, 96 per cent think that schools should provide sex education to children and young people (Allen, 1987).

THE VALUE FOR THE SCHOOL

Pastoral care is concerned with the 'health' and functioning of the organisation as well as with individual pupils.

(Hamblin, 1981)

One could argue that the pastoral organisation was an intuitive response to regarding the child as the customer, an internal agency to make sure that each child got the best mix available out of the product range on offer ... that part of the organisation (which connects products and customers) ought to be the driving force of the organisation, the one that sets the priorities and the tone and calls the tune. My conversations suggest that in most schools it is the production system, not the internal marketing system, which is dominant. Excellent companies maintain a regular survey and feedback programme from customer to organisation. In schools the feedback system runs the other way round - from organisation to customer (child or parent). Accountability in the education system often means the school explaining what it is doing to its customers, rather than asking its customers whether and when they are satisfied.

(Handy, 1984)

Concepts of school and teacher effectiveness imply the sort of constructive and co-operative pupil-teacher relationships which are one of the characteristics of effective pastoral care.

(Galloway, 1985)

The evidence suggests that schools with high exclusion rates may be less successful than schools with low exclusion rates in persuading the majority of pupils that teachers are interested in them (apart from a natural interest in the quality of their schoolwork).

(Galloway *et al.*, 1982, on ten secondary schools)

Six characteristics of pastoral care in four secondary schools each selected for its low level of disruptive behaviour:

- The principal aim of pastoral care is to enhance educational progress.
- Distinguishing 'pastoral' and 'discipline' problems is seen as spurious.
- Class teachers are not encouraged to pass problems to senior staff.
- Pastoral care is based on tutors, from whom advice about pupils is sought.
- Pastoral care for teachers is in evidence.
- The climate promotes discussion of disruptive behaviour without recrimination.

(Galloway, 1983)

A school which fails to care for its staff is not likely to be caring effectively for its students.

(Murgatroyd, 1986)

Training research and research on teaching and learning have reached the stage where a system that increases student aptitude, achievement, and personal and social development can be designed with confidence . . . The individual, school, and systemic components need to be oriented towards changes in practice that offer promise for student growth in the personal, social and academic domains.

(Joyce and Showers, 1988)

Schools in which form tutors carry out mainly administrative functions, such as taking registers and reading notices, tend to suffer from more disruptive behaviour than schools in which they are actively involved in disciplinary, counselling and guidance activities, monitoring academic progress and other pastoral work.

(Department of Education and Science, 1989)

THE VALUE FOR THE WORLD OF WORK

Sound careers guidance and advice in schools, further education and employment is central to providing each individual with a high quality personal guidance base throughout their career . . . Broader occupational competence should be concerned with adaptability, management of roles, responsibility for standards, creativity and flexibility to changing demand. Task competence is not enough to meet this need although some employers, concentrating on their short term needs, may believe it is.

(CBI, 1989)

There still remains the need for a timetabled slot of careers education in the curriculum. Despite improvements with the introduction of careers education as a cross-curricular theme, this is not enough.

(Nicholson, 1993)

Following on the heels of basic skills and relevant knowledge, business expects from the education system 'motivated pupils and social/team skills' (CBI, 1988).

Students leaving school see employers as valuing most highly personal skills, and they value them themselves, but do not consider they are gaining them at school. On teamwork skills, they see employers as valuing these, and do not rate highly their advancement at school (CBI, 1992).

It is argued that Careers Guidance fosters efficiency and social equity. It supports individual decisions, reduced drop-out and mismatch, and contributes to improvements in the world of work (Killeen *et al.*, 1992).

There is compelling evidence from our research that many young people and their parents are at sea with respect to what needs to be done to ensure their futures. The essential antidote is to give career and personal counselling a much higher status, not only through the specialists involved in it, but also in the jobs of teaching and training themselves.

(Banks *et al.*, 1992, considering 4,830 16 to 19-year-olds in five areas of Britain)

A major study of the guidance needs of young people revealed that they viewed the development of social skills for work as a major requirement for their future (Eaton and Daws, 1987) and that they are influenced most in guidance by persons with whom they have a well-established relationship.

Those having regular careers lessons had a greater knowledge of the world of work than their peers who had no such lessons, ... were less reliant on their family for careers advice, and used a wider range of sources for career knowledge, ... and were more aware of the preparations necessary for job interviews.

(Chamberlain, 1982, considering 274 fifth-form students from six schools)

Schools providing formal careers education in the fourth or fifth years had pupils whose scores suggested a gain of six months' vocational awareness.

(Cherry and Gear, 1987, considering 1,366 pupils in twenty English secondary schools)

Where there is a careers education programme in the school, fifth-year pupils made much more progress in vocational awareness in interviews with careers officers (Bedford, 1982, on 680 interviews in two hundred schools)

THE VALUE FOR SOCIETY AT LARGE

The benefits of learning are economic, personal and social ... Those nations that invest in learning gain economic, social and personal benefits for their citizens: those that fail to do so suffer decline. [We recommend] embedding careers education and guidance within the mainstream of the curriculum and education process, rather than positioning them as external and marginal adjuncts to formal learning.

(Ball, 1992)

We have unearthed a number of results which seem to indicate that

- drinking rates are lower in schools where alcohol education is delivered through PSE
- drinking rates are higher if the programme is delivered through Science' (Balding and Bish, 1992, considering thirty schools)

Preventive education on matters such as smoking is more effective when the personal-social dimension is addressed.

The implications of the school effects appear to show that smoking rates were significantly lower where the school gave a relatively high profile to social/health education as a firm, separate and important curriculum area . . . The differences in smoking rate are such as to indicate that lessons embedded in social/health education curriculum seem more successful.

(Clift *et al.*, 1989; Eiser *et al.*, 1988; Jamison and MacNeil, 1992)

THE AGENDA FOR DEVELOPMENT

The evidence demonstrates the value of effective pastoral care and PSE as one dimension of the effective school. A continuing focus on these areas is necessary.

Development is the responsibility of the individual school, and requires a co-ordinated and collective approach to evaluation, review and planning.

Professional evaluations such as HMI reports and surveys have continued to present evidence and analyses which highlight the characteristics of effective work in pastoral care and PSE (HMI, 1988; HMI, 1989; HMI, 1992). These provide useful frameworks for a school to review its practice.

An additional stimulus to maintain the focus will be the regular inspection of schools. This will be developed according to OFSTED's Framework and Handbook (Office for Standards in Education, 1993) which currently include main sections on:

- pupils' support and guidance;
- pupils' social and cultural development;
- pupils' spiritual and moral development;
- links with parents and liaison with other schools;
- attendance;
- behaviour and discipline.

Schools will be expected to provide documentation on such areas, and inspection teams will seek evidence through indicators of performance in them. The management of the school will also be under scrutiny: pastoral care and PSE, however organized, will be expected to show evidence of systematic review, monitoring and evaluation of its performance in relation to pupils' achievement.

REFERENCES

- Allen, I. (1987) *Education in Sex and Personal Relationships*. London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Assessment of Performance Unit (1981) *Personal and Social Development*. London: DES.
- Balding, J. and Bish, D. (1992) *Alcohol Education in Schools*. Exeter: Schools Health Education Unit, University of Exeter.

- Ball, C. (1992) *Profitable Learning*. London: Royal Society for the Arts.
- Banks, M., Bates, I., Breakwell, G., Bynner, J., Emler, N., Jamieson, L. and Roberts, K. (1992) *Careers and Identities*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Bedford, T. (1982) *Vocational Guidance Interviews: A Survey by the Careers Service Inspectorate*. London: Department of Employment.
- Bennett, N. and Dunne, E. (1992) *Managing Classroom Groups*. Hemel Hempstead: Simon & Schuster.
- Braun, D. and Schonveld, A. (1992) *Preparation for Parenthood: Myth or Reality?* Coventry: Community Education Development Centre.
- CBI (1988) *Building a Stronger Partnership between Business and Secondary Education*. London: CBI.
- CBI (1989) *Towards a Skills Revolution: Report of the Vocational Education and Training Task Force*. London: CBI.
- CBI (1992) *Survey of Students' Attitudes: 17- and 18-year olds going to Higher Education*. London: CBI.
- Chamberlain, P. (1982) Careers lessons and career awareness of fifth form students. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, **10**, 74–82.
- Cherry, N. and Gear, R. (1987) Young people's perceptions of their vocational guidance needs: II. Influences and interventions. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, **15**, 169–81.
- Clift, S., Stears, D., Legg, S., Memon, A. and Ryan, L. (1989) *The HIV/AIDS Education and Young People Project: Report on Phase 1*. Canterbury: Christ Church College, HIV/AIDS Education Research Unit.
- Cohen, P. A., Kulik, J. A. and Kulik, C.-L. C. (1982) Educational outcomes of tutoring: a meta-analysis of findings. *American Educational Research Journal*, **19**, 237–48.
- deCharms, R. (1972) Personal causation training in the schools. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, **2**, 95–113.
- Department of Education and Science (1989) *Discipline in Schools: Report of the Committee of Enquiry Chaired by Lord Elton*. London: DES/HMSO.
- Eaton, M. and Daws, P. P. (1987) *A TRAWL Perspective on Guidance Provision*. Belfast: NICED.
- Eiser, J. R., Morgan, M. and Gammage, P. (1988) Social education is good for health. *Educational Research*, **30**, 20–5.
- Elliott, J. (1981) How do parents choose schools? In Elliott, J. (ed.) *School Accountability*. London: Grant McIntyre.
- Fitz-Gibbon, C. (1988) Peer tutoring as a teaching strategy. *Educational Management and Administration*, **16**, 217–29.
- Gallagher, M., Millar, R., Hargie, O. and Ellis, R. (1992) The personal and social worries of adolescents in Northern Ireland: results of a survey. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, **20**, 274–90.
- Galloway, D. (1983) Disruptive pupils and effective pastoral care. *School Organisation*, **3**, 245–54.

- Galloway, D. (1985) Pastoral care and school effectiveness. In Reynolds, D. (ed.) *Studying School Effectiveness*. Lewes: Falmer Press.
- Galloway, D., Ball, T., Blomfield, D. and Seyed, R. (1982) *Schools and Disruptive Pupils*. Harlow: Longman.
- Gibbs, G. (1992) *Improving the Quality of Student Learning*. Bristol: Technical and Educational Services.
- Hamblin, D. H. (1981) Pastoral care and pupil performance. In Hamblin, D. H. (ed.) *Problems and Practice of Pastoral Care*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Handy, C. (1984) *Taken for Granted? Understanding Schools as Organisations*. York: Longmans for Schools Council.
- Hargreaves, D. H. (1990) Making schools more effective: the challenge to policy, practice and research. *Scottish Educational Review*, **22**, 5–14.
- HMI (1988) *A Survey of Personal and Social Education Courses in Some Secondary Schools: Report 235/88*. Stanimore: DES.
- HMI (1989) *Pastoral Care in Secondary Schools: An Inspection of Some Aspects of Pastoral Care in 1987–8*. Stanimore: DES.
- HMI (1992) *Survey of Guidance 13–19 in Schools and Sixth Form Colleges*. Stanimore: DES.
- Hopson, B. and Hough, P. (1976) The need for personal and social education in secondary schools and further education. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, **4**, 17–27.
- Jamison, J. and MacNeil, M. (1992) Can health education change school practices and young people's attitudes and behaviour? Paper given at NFER Annual Conference, Slough, 1992.
- Johnson, D. (1990) *Parental Choice in Education*. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Jones, B. F. and Fennimore, T. F. (1990) *The New Definition of Learning*. Elmhurst, Ill.: North Central Regional Educational Laboratory.
- Joyce, B. and Showers, B. (1988) *Student Achievement through Staff Development*. Harlow: Longman.
- Killeen, J., White, M. and Watts, A. G. (1992) *The Economic Value of Careers Guidance*. London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Millar, R., Gallagher, M. and Ellis, R. (1993) Surveying adolescent worries: development of the 'Things I Worry About' scale. *Pastoral Care in Education*, **11**, 43–51.
- Murgatroyd, S. (1986) Management teams and the promotion of staff well-being. *School Organisation*, **6**, 115–21.
- National Confederation of Parent-Teachers Associations (1991) *The State of Schools in England and Wales*. Gravesend: NCPTA.
- Nicholson, S. B. (1993) What are the needs? In Ball, S. C. (ed.) *Guidance Matters*. London: RSA.
- Office for Standards in Education (1993) *Handbook for the Inspection of Schools*. London: OFSTED/DFE.
- Petch, A. J. (1986) Parents' reasons for choosing secondary schools. In Stillman, A. (ed.) *The Balancing Act of 1980: Parents, Politics and Education*. Slough: NFER.

- Poole, M. E. and Evans, G. T. (1988) Life skills: adolescents' perceptions of importance and competence. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, **16**, 129–44.
- Porteous, M. A. and Kelleher, E. (1987) School climate differences and problem admission in secondary schools. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, **15**, 72–81.
- Ramsden, P. (1988) *Improving Learning: New Perspectives*. London: Kogan Page.
- Rutter, M. (1983) School effects on pupil progress: research findings and policy implications. *Child Development*, **54**, 1–29.
- Rutter, M. (1991) Pathways from childhood to adult life: the role of schooling. *Pastoral Care in Education*, **9**, 3–10.
- Selmes, I. (1987) *Improving Study Skills*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Slavin, R. E. (1990) *Cooperative Learning: Theory, Research, and Practice*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ.: Prentice-Hall.
- Wehlage, G. G., Rutter, R. A., Smith, G. A., Lesko, N. and Fernandez, R. R. (1989) *Reducing the Risk: Schools as Communities of Support*. London: Falmer.